School Ethics Commission Meeting Public Session Minutes

December 17, 2024

Chairperson Bender called the regularly scheduled meeting of the School Ethics Commission (Commission or SEC) to order at 9:40 a.m.

Notice of the special meeting was provided to the State House Press Corps and the Secretary of State and filed as required by the Open Public Meetings Act.

I. Roll Call

| Roll Call | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|--------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Present | Х | | | X^1 | Х | Х | 4 |
| Absent | | Х | Х | | | | 0 |

Also, in attendance were Brigid C. Martens, Director, Office of School Ethics, Jeannine Pizzigoni² and Dana Jones, staff members, and Amna Toor, Deputy Attorney General (DAG).

II. First Public Comment

There were not any members of the public present.

III. Executive Session

At 9:41 a.m., the following Resolution was read:

Whereas, the Open Public Meetings Act (*N.J.S.A.* 10:4-6 *et seq.*) authorizes the Commission, a public body, to meet in Executive Session under certain circumstances; and

Whereas, the Open Public Meetings Act requires that the Commission adopt a Resolution at a public meeting to go into Executive Session; and

Now therefore be it resolved that, consistent with the provisions of *N.J.A.C.* 10:4-12(b), the Commission will adjourn to Executive Session to discuss matters which, by statute, are regarded as confidential and also to discuss matters possibly involving litigation: C16-21; C25-24; C26-24; C27-24; C29-24; C30-24; C39-24; C75-19; C50-21 and C72-21 (Consolidated); C90-23; A15-24; C78-24 and C67-22; and

¹ Commissioner Roberts participated virtually.

² Staff member Pizzigoni participated virtually.

Now therefore be it further resolved that the Commission will return to open session to conduct business at the conclusion of Executive Session.

Motion was made by Carol E. Sabo, and seconded by Dennis Roberts, to adjourn to Executive Session to discuss the matters set forth in the foregoing Resolution.

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | Х | | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

Vote

IV. Return to Public

At **10:59 a.m.**, a motion was made by Richard Tomko, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to return to public session for the purpose of receiving public comment/testimony, and to vote on matters discussed in Executive Session (as appropriate).

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | Х | | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

V. Complaints to Review

C16-21 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to draft a decision as discussed.

| Vote | Robert Bender | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | Х | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | 0 |

C25-24 Motion was made by Carol E. Sabo, and seconded by Dennis Roberts, to table the matter.

Vote

| Vote | | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|---|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | Х | | | Х | Х | | 3 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | Х | 1 |

C26-24 Motion was made by Carol E. Sabo, and seconded by Dennis Roberts, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

| Vote | Robert Bender | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | Х | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | 0 |

C27-24 Motion was made by Carol E. Sabo, and seconded by Dennis Roberts, to table the matter.

Vote

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | Х | | | Х | Х | | 3 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | Х | 1 |

C29-24 Motion was made by Richard Tomko, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | X | | | Х | X | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

C30-24 Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to draft a decision as discussed.

| Vote | | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|---|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | Х | | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

C39-24 Motion was made by Carol E. Sabo, and seconded by Richard Tomko, to draft a decision as discussed.

Vote

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | X | | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

VI. Decisions to Adopt as Written

C75-19 Motion was made by Richard Tomko, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adopt the decision as written.

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | Х | | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

C50-21 and C72-21 (Consolidated) Motion was made by Richard Tomko, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | X | | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

C90-23 Motion was made by Richard Tomko, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adopt the decision as written.

Vote

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | X | | | Х | Х | X | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

VII. Advisory Opinions

A15-24 Motion was made by Richard Tomko, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adopt the advisory opinion as written.

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | X | | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

Vote

VIII. Administrative Dismissals

C78-24 This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

IX. Other Business

C67-22 This matter was on the agenda for informational purposes only.

X. Minutes

Motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Richard Tomko, to adopt the minutes of the regularly scheduled meeting (public and executive) conducted on November 26, 2024.

| Vote | Robert Bender | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | X | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | 0 |

XI. Second Public Comment

There were not any members of the public present.

XII. Adjournment

At 11:06 a.m., a motion was made by Dennis Roberts, and seconded by Carol E. Sabo, to adjourn.

| Vote | Robert Bender | Michael Carucci | Mark Finkelstein | Dennis Roberts | Carol E. Sabo | Richard Tomko | Total |
|------------|------------------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|-------|
| Yes | X | | | Х | Х | Х | 4 |
| No | | | | | | | 0 |
| Abstention | | | | | | | 0 |

Submitted by:

Jeannine Pizzigoni

Approved by:

Brigid C. Martens, Director School Ethics Commission